
Review

Reviewed Work(s): Bach for Brass: Sämtliche Blechbläserpartien Johann Sebastian Bachs in Stimmenpartitur mit Pauken = Johann Sebastian Bach's Complete Brass Parts in a Short Score including Timpani. Band 2: Kantaten BWV 101 ff., (Stuttgarter Bach-Ausgaben) by Johann Sebastian Bach, Edward H. Tarr, Uwe Wolf, Frans Berglund and Philip Tarr; L'Allegro, il Pensieroso ed il Moderato: Oratorio in three parts, HWV 55; version of 1741. (Stuttgarter Händel-Ausgaben) by George Frideric Handel, Friedrich Chrysander, Helmut Bornefeld and Matthias Wamser; Messiah, HWV 56. (Stuttgarter Händel-Ausgaben) by George Frideric Handel, Ton Koopman and Jan H. Siemons; Die lateinischen Messen = The Latin Masses in Eleven Volumes, Hob. XXII: 1-14. (Urtext) by Joseph Haydn; Geistliche Musik für Chor und Orchester = The Sacred Vocal Music with Orchestra in Critical Editions. (Stuttgarter Mendelssohn-Ausgaben.) (Vol. 1, vol. 2, vol. 3, vol. 4, vol. 5, vol. 6, vol. 7, vol. 8, vol. 9, vol. 10, vol. 11, vol. 12, vol. 13, vol. 14, vol. 15, vol. 16, vol. 17, vol. 18, vol. 19, vol. 20, vol. 21, vol. 22) by Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy; Preludio sinfonico, SC32. (Urtext) by Giacomo Puccini and Michele Girardi

Review by: James Wintle

Source: *Notes*, Second Series, Vol. 67, No. 1 (September 2010), pp. 183-187

Published by: Music Library Association

Stable URL: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40858238>

Accessed: 13-08-2017 05:11 UTC

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <http://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

Music Library Association is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Notes*

Brahms-Gesamtausgabe," *Johannes Brahms: Quellen, Text, Rezeption, Interpretation: Internationaler Brahms-Kongress, Hamburg 1997*, ed. Friedhelm Krummacher, Michael Struck, et al., 247–65 [Munich: G. Henle, 1999]).

Accompanying discussion of the history of each work, given in the volume's *Einleitung*, has been beautifully prepared by Michael Musgrave, and addresses genesis and revisions, early performances and reception in Germany and abroad (with a number of quotations from contemporaneous reviews), as well as publication. Musgrave draws frequently on Brahms's personal correspondence for dates and other information (e.g., concerning early versions of the works and the lost sources that would have preserved them), and, with assistance from Robert Pascall and Michael Struck, has assigned corrected dates to several of the relevant letters.

This volume incorporates a number of facsimile excerpts from autograph and other sources; the vast majority of these are otherwise unavailable in reproduction. For opus 11, facsimiles include the opening of the work in the autograph score, showing the title change (from "Sinfonie-Serenade") and the correction of "op. 18" to "op. 11," as well as the first ten measures of the Serenade, mm. 176–84 and 539–50 of the first movement, mm. 1–10 of the second, and mm. 19–38 and 87–88 of the third movement, all from the same autograph. Also included in facsimile are mm. 167–84 of the third movement from the autograph arrangement for piano four-hands, with the deleted original version of mm. 167–73. For opus 16, reproductions include the title page and mm. 13–23 of the first movement from the engraver's model for the first edi-

tion, with autograph revisions; the title page of the revision model for the 1875 edition, with markings by Simrock, and mm. 6–7 and 56–96 of the first movement, mm. 19–38 of the second movement, and mm. 1–15 of the fourth movement from the same source; and a reproduction of a preserved photograph of the first page of a lost autograph piccolo part for the sixth movement. Just as the edited scores themselves are easy on the eyes, the quality of the facsimiles is clear and legible.

As Donald McCorkle has suggested, "A definitive edition is to be evaluated by the professional qualifications of its editors, by the quality (completeness and reliability) of the original sources used as basis, the reliability and accuracy of the editorial work, and the quality of the critical reports to document the editorial revisions, as well as certainly the interest of the publisher in producing an ultimately reliable edition" ("Five Fundamental Obstacles," p. 261). By such standards, this volume certainly deserves to be considered the most definitive edition of the serenades yet produced. The inclusion of editorial notes in English would have been helpful, and would render the results of the editor's considerable efforts more easily and more thoroughly accessible to a wider readership. It might be mentioned, as well, that although the price tags on other volumes have already been high enough to prove prohibitive to many an individual, at \$486 the cost of this new volume is higher than that of any other yet issued. Nonetheless, this is another volume of fine work that is sure to benefit scholars and performers in the years to come.

JACQUELYN SHOLES
Wellesley College

NEW SCORES FROM CARUS VERLAG

Johann Sebastian Bach. *Bach for Brass: Sämtliche Blechbläserpartien Johann Sebastian Bachs in Stimmenpartitur mit Pauken = Johann Sebastian Bach's Complete Brass Parts in a Short Score including Timpani. Band 2: Kantaten BWV 101 ff., für Trompeten und Pauken/Zink (Horn/Posaune).* Herausgegeben von = edited by Edward H. Tarr and Uwe Wolf, assisted by Frans Berglund and Philip Tarr. (Stuttgarter Bach-Ausgaben.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, 2009. [Pref. in Eng., Fre., Ger., p. iii–vii; score, p. 2–177; facsim., p. 178. ISBN-13 979-0-007-09370-9; ISMN M-007-09370-9; pub. no. CV 31.302. €50.]

George Frideric Handel. *L'Allegro, il Pensieroso ed il Moderato: Oratorio in three parts, HWV 55; version of 1741.* Based on editions by Friedrich Chrysander and Helmut Bornefeld, revised by Matthias Wamser. (Stuttgarter Händel-Ausgaben.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, 2009. [Foreword in Eng., Ger., p. iii–viii; Konkordanz, p. ix–xiii; score, p. 1–180; Krit. Bericht in Ger., p. 182–83. ISBN-13 979-007-09443-0; ISMN M-007-09443-0; pub. no. CV 29.214. €68.]

George Frideric Handel. *Messiah, HWV 56.* Herausgegeben von = Edited by Ton Koopman and Jan H. Siemons. (Stuttgarter Händel-Ausgaben.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, 2009. [Foreword in Eng., Fre., Ger., p. v–xv; facsim., p. xvi–xxi; score, p. 1–293; crit. report in Eng., Ger., p. 296–306. ISBN-13 979-007-01628-9; ISMN M-007-01628-9; pub. no. CV 55.056. €99.]

Joseph Haydn. *Die lateinischen Messen = The Latin Masses in Eleven Volumes, Hob. XXII: 1–14.* Various editors. (Urtext.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, [2008]. [11 study scores in slipcase. ISBN-13 978-3-89948-097-9; ISMN M-007-04899-0; pub. no. CV 51.900. €179.]

Felix Mendelssohn-Bartholdy. *Geistliche Musik für Chor und Orchester = The Sacred Vocal Music with Orchestra in Critical Editions.* Various editors. (Stuttgarter Mendelssohn-Ausgaben.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, [2008]. [22 study scores in slipcase. (Vol. 1, Paulus = St Paul, op. 36; vol. 2, Elias = Elijah, op. 70; vol. 3, Christus, op. 97; vol. 4, Der 42. Psalm, op. 42; vol. 5, Der 95. Psalm, op. 46; vol. 6, Der 98. Psalm, op. 91; vol. 7, Der 114. Psalm, op. 51; vol. 8, Der 115. Psalm, op. 31; vol. 9, Ach Gott, vom Himmel sieh darein; vol. 10, O Haupt voll Blut und Wunden; vol. 11, Zwei Choralkantaten; vol. 12, Drei Choralkantaten; vol. 13, Vom Himmel hoch; vol. 14, Lobgesang, op. 52; vol. 15, Lauda Sion, op. 73; vol. 16, Hymne, op. 96; vol. 17, Tu es Petrus, op. 111; vol. 18, Gloria; vol. 19, Magnificat; vol. 20, Kyrie; Herr Gott, dich loben wir; vol. 21, Hymne, Hör mein Bitten; vol. 22, Geistliche Musik für Solostimme.) ISBN-10 3-89948-096-1; ISBN-13 978-3-89948-096-2; ISMN M-007-03857-1; pub. no. CV 40.900. €299.]

Giacomo Puccini. *Preludio sinfonico, SC32.* Herausgegeben von = Edited by Michele Girardi. (Urtext.) Stuttgart: Carus Verlag, 2009. [Pref. in Eng., Ger., Ita., p. 2–4; score, p. 5–33; crit. report in Ger., p. 34–40. ISBN-13 979-0007-06358-0; ISMN M-007-06358-0; pub. no. CV 16.206. €20.]

Bach for Brass, volume 2, is part of a series that will eventually contain the complete brass parts of Johann Sebastian Bach in short score, including timpani parts where applicable. Of the seven planned volumes, four have so far been published. The first

two include music from the cantatas, the third volume presents excerpts from Bach's Latin church music and oratorios, and the fourth volume is concerned with his orchestral music. The volume under review here contains brass parts for cantatas

101–249. Although most of the excerpts here are for trumpet, there are also pieces for cornetto, French horn, and trombone. The collection is the first of its kind to use, as its primary source material, the original parts from which Bach's musicians played. Information concerning the dates of known performances directed by Bach, the liturgical context of the composition, original instrumentation, the sources used for the edition and the corresponding volume of the *Neue Bach-Ausgabe* is provided.

George Frideric Handel's 1740 oratorio *L'Allegro, il Penseroso ed il Moderato*, HWV 55, is not among his best known works. However, it contains a number of well known arias such as "Sweet Bird" for soprano and flute obbligato, "Come, and Trip It," "Let Me Wander Not Unseen," and the beautiful soprano/tenor duet "As Steals the Morn." The new Carus edition of the full score, revised by Matthias Wamser, is something of a curiosity in that its purpose is not to re-examine the latest and most authoritative sources, but instead to pay tribute to the work of German musicologist Friedrich Chrysander (1826–1901), who in 1859 produced an edition of the piece for the Deutsche Händel-Gesellschaft (German Handel Society). Chrysander's edition relies primarily on Handel's 1741 revision of the work, which has additional arias not found in the original 1740 version. Although Chrysander's choice of Handel's later version was partially a consequence of limited access to source material, Carus Verlag maintains Chrysander's vision in this new edition. An overriding criticism of Chrysander's Handel edition has been the lack of critical reports to explain his editorial choices. The new Carus edition remedies this problem with a very informative foreword (including a concordance showing the differences between the Chrysander edition and that published in the newer *Hallische Händel-Ausgabe* [HHA]), along with a full critical report for Chrysander's text. In fact, the HHA volume (series 1, vol. 16) of *L'Allegro, il Penseroso ed il Moderato*, published in 1969, is itself strikingly similar to Chrysander's edition, the most obvious difference being the omission of Chrysander's piano reduction/basso continuo realization, which appears below the original figured bass line in Carus's new edition and in Chrysander's 1859 one. In

addition, Matthias Wamser has provided numbering for the individual pieces within the oratorio. This is a small detail, but one that adds a great deal to the usability of this edition for performance. Also adding to the Carus edition's ease of use is the omission of the German text that appeared below the English in Chrysander's original edition. Matthias Wamser and Carus Verlag have done an excellent job in creating a new edition of the full score of this great work that combines the definitive text of the Chrysander edition with the scholarly transparency and convenience of the *Hallische Händel-Ausgabe*.

Carus's new edition of the full score of Handel's *Messiah*, HWV 56, has been edited by famed conductor, keyboardist, and baroque-music scholar Ton Koopman, aided by Jan H. Siemons. If it were not for the presence of Koopman's name on this edition, one might be inclined to ignore yet another version of *Messiah*. That would, however, be a mistake. The present edition has a clear purpose and place in the number of *Messiah* scores currently on the market. Koopman and Siemons have prepared a reliable scholarly edition of the full score using Handel's autograph score and two copyists' scores as primary sources, along with six different secondary sources. Their critical report provides appropriate detail about the myriad movement versions produced by Handel for various performances of *Messiah* during his later career.

Perhaps the most intriguing element in this edition is its foreword. In it Koopman touches briefly, but effectively, on a number of performance-practice issues that plague modern performances of *Messiah*. He gives informed opinions concerning appropriate performing forces, the use of keyboard instruments, ornamentation, and over-dotting. He reminds the reader that flexibility is the most important virtue in baroque performance, and that what is correct in one measure may not be in the next. Unlike most available editions of *Messiah*, Koopman and Siemons include all of the movement variations that can be reliably assigned to Handel within the main body of the score. Versions of the same movements are presented chronologically in succession, with preference given to the version found in Handel's autograph full score. Autograph versions of movements

which Handel never performed are given in an appendix. This is in contrast to the more common practice of providing only the most performed versions within the score, and to relegate all "alternate" versions to an appendix; and interestingly, the vocal score prepared from this edition presents the movements in this very way. However, by presenting the movements chronologically in the full score the editors are allowing conductors to more easily reconstruct individual performances of Handel's *Messiah* as they would have been heard at specific times and places. This process is further assisted by a concordance, included before the foreword, that lists movement usage in Handel's own performances of the work between 1742 and 1754, with the most common version (that of London, 1745/1749) highlighted.

The first (chronologically) of Carus's two recently-published reprint collections is of Haydn's Latin Masses, Hob. XXII: 1–14. This collection consists of twelve study scores in a decorative case, issued to mark the 200th anniversary of Haydn's death in 2009. Each volume presents a critical-edition study score that includes a detailed foreword in German with abridged versions in English and French. The foreword presents information about source material, scoring, and performance history. A variety of editors are represented in the collection, since each work has been published previously by Carus Verlag in a full-size format. The collection also includes spurious works such as the *Missa "Rorate coeli desuper"* in G, Hob. XXII: 3, and arrangements such as Luigi Gatti's *Schöpfungsmesse* in A, in which Gatti set the Mass text to music originally written by Haydn for his oratorio *The Creation*.

The second reprint collection contains the complete sacred music for choir and orchestra of Felix Mendelssohn. Also prepared for a special occasion, the 200th anniversary of the composer's birth in 2009, this one includes twenty-two study scores in a slipcase. As with the Haydn collection, each work is presented in a critical edition with an informative foreword and complete critical notes. The foreword translations are abridged from those in the original full-size scores, just as in the Haydn set. The original editions were prepared as part of Carus's Stuttgarter Mendelssohn-Ausgaben

series by renowned scholars such as R. Larry Todd. The collection includes the oratorios, psalm settings, chorale cantatas, and miscellaneous pieces of Latin and German sacred music. In addition to the set of study scores, Carus Verlag has produced twelve separately-issued recordings of this repertoire by the Kammerchor Stuttgart conducted by Frieder Bernius, which handily complement this collection.

Finally, the recent publication of Michele Girardi's edition of Giacomo Puccini's *Preludio sinfonico*, SC32, is a welcome addition to the catalog. Two editions of the piece have been published previously, both of them prepared using two sets of orchestral parts which combine autograph and copyist's sources, and are housed in the Istituto Musicale "Luigi Boccherini" in Lucca. The first edition was produced by Pietro Spada in 1977 for Elkan-Vogel (PN 466-00027). Accompanying that edition is a short foreword, which outlines the history of the piece and lists the source material. However, there is no clear indication of the editorial additions or changes that would have inevitably occurred during the reconstruction of the score. The second was edited by Johann Wojciechowski and published in 1988 by C. F. Peters (EP 8625). Although based on the same sources, there are a number of minor differences between the two editions. The Peters edition also lacks critical notes that might explain these differences, and gives an incorrect date of composition of 1876. At the time, it was generally believed that the *Preludio sinfonico* was written around the same time as Puccini's earlier *Preludio a orchestra* (SC1) in E minor. This misconception arose from a lack of definitive source material for either piece. The autograph score for the *Preludio a orchestra* was in a private collection, and was not available for close examination until 1999. In addition, the copyist's manuscript of the full score of the later *Preludio sinfonico* (SC32), which includes corrections and additions by the composer including the correct date of composition, 1882, had not been fully examined. The full score of SC32 with Puccini's corrections is held in the library of the Conservatorio di musica "Giuseppe Verdi" in Milan. To add to the confusion, both pieces have been published under the title *Preludio sinfonico*, with only the key to differ-

entiate between them. The new Carus edition takes advantage of all of the available autograph and copyist's sources listed in Dieter Schickling's *Giacomo Puccini: Catalogue of the Works* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2003). Michele Girardi has prepared the Carus edition in cooperation with the Fondazione Puccini and the Centro di studi "G. Puccini" in Lucca. The foreword, written in Italian and translated into both German and English, includes information regarding the source material for the edition, the piece's general history and a short

descriptive analysis. The critical notes at the end of the publication, printed only in German, give a detailed account of the decisions that were made and issues that arose during the editorial process. Whether in scholarly study or performance, the new Carus edition will be an essential tool for anyone who wishes to explore Puccini's early style.

JAMES WINTLE
Library of Congress

